Proceedings of the Arizona Game and Fish Commission License Revocation and Civil Assessment Hearings
Time Certain – 2:00 p.m.
Friday, March 4, 2016
City Hall Council Chambers

1011 N. Coronado Dr. Sierra Vista, Arizona 85635

PRESENT: (Commission) (Director's Staff)

Chairman Kurt R. Davis Deputy Director Ty E. Gray

Commissioner Edward "Pat" Madden
Commissioner James R. Ammons
Commissioner James S. Zieler

Assistant Attorney General Jim Odenkirk
Assistant Attorney General Linda Pollock

Commissioner James S. Zielei

Commissioner Eric S. Sparks Director Voyles was not present.

Hearings on License Revocations for Violation of Game and Fish Codes and Civil Assessments for the Illegal Taking and/or Possession of Wildlife

**Presenter:** Gene Elms, Law Enforcement Branch Chief

Mr. Elms presented the cases below to the Commission. Each of these cases were reviewed and it was determined that all cases met the criteria established in A.R.S. §17-238, §17-245 §17-314, §17-340, §17-362, §17-363 and/or §17-502 for Commission action. The Commission and the respondents were provided with copies of the original court docket and case reports prepared by the officers along with copies of all other pertinent materials in each of these cases. Each of the following individuals was legally noticed for this hearing.

Name	Docket #	Count	Conviction
Michael E. Morris	2016-0001	Count A:	Unlawful take of wildlife except as permitted by
			Title 17 (Coyote)
		Count B:	Unlawful take of wildlife except as permitted by
			Title 17 (Bobcat)
		Count C:	Unlawful possession of wildlife except as
			permitted by Title 17 (7 Bobcats)
Joseph W. Balma	2016-0019	Count D:	Take wildlife during a closed season (Javelina)
Irene M. Charette	2016-0020	Count A:	Possess unlawfully taken wildlife (Javelina)
Ramon A. De La Torre	2016-0021	Count A:	Possess/transport unlawfully taken wildlife
			(Mule Deer)
		Count B:	Possess/transport wildlife without tag attached
			(Mule Deer)
Luigi Zanette	2016-0022	Count A:	Take in excess of possession limit (Dove)
Luciano Turchet	2016-0023	Count A:	Take in excess of possession limit (Dove)
Daniel Gaiotto	2016-0024	Count A:	Take in excess of possession limit (Dove)
		Citation A0'	7023
	Citation A01404		
Christopher M. Perez	2016-0026	Count A:	Take wildlife without a valid license (3X3
			Trophy White-tailed deer)
Citation A01353			

Count B: Possession of unlawfully take wildlife (White-

tailed deer Buck)

### Citation A01406

Count A: Take wildlife without a valid license (White-tailed deer Doe)

### Citation A01435

Count A: Take wildlife without a valid license (Gambel's quail)

### Citation A01433

Count A: Take wildlife without a valid license (Red-tailed hawk)

## Citation A07124

Christopher J. Ball 2016-0027

Count A: Take wildlife without a valid license (Five White-tailed deer)

Count C: Take wildlife by unlawful method (Five White-tailed deer)

### Citation A07122

Count A: Take wildlife without a valid license (2X2 White-tailed Deer)

### Citation A01394

Count A: Take wildlife without a valid license (3X3 Trophy White-tailed Deer)

### Citation A01438

Count A: Take wildlife without a valid license (4X4 Trophy Mule Deer)

### Citation A01400

Count A: Take wildlife without a valid license (3X3 Trophy White-tailed Deer)

# Citation A01398

Count A: Take wildlife without a valid license (3X3 Trophy White-tailed Deer)

# Citation A01396

Count A: Possess/transport unlawfully taken wildlife (White-tailed Deer Doe)

### Citation A07127

Count A: Take wildlife without a valid license (Gray Fox)

# Christopher M. Perez 2016-0028

### Citation A01430

Count A: Take wildlife without a valid license (Five White-tailed deer)

Count C: Take wildlife by unlawful method (Five White-tailed deer)

## Citation A01428

Count A: Take wildlife without a valid license (2 X 2 White-tailed Deer)

### Citation A01422

Count A: Take wildlife without a valid license (3X3 Trophy White-tailed Deer)

# Citation A01437

Count A: Take wildlife without a valid license (4X4 Trophy Mule Deer)

# Citation A01426

Count A: Take wildlife without a valid license (3X3 Trophy White-tailed Deer)

Citation A01424

Count A: Take wildlife without a valid license (3X3)

Trophy White-tailed Deer)

**Citation A01410** 

Count A: Take wildlife without a valid license (White-

tailed Deer Doe)

Citation A01434

Count A: Take wildlife without a valid license (Gray Fox)

Citation A06836

James Duncan 2016-0029 Count A: Obtain 2014 resident elk tag by fraud

Roll call was taken and the following were present: Ramon De La Torre and James Duncan.

Mr. Elms informed the Commission that the cases of Zanette, Turchet and Gaiotto were continued to a future Commission meeting. The Department recently received information from this group's legal counsel and the Department's attorneys need to respond to it.

Mr. Elms stated that the civil assessment process is not intended to be punitive, but is a process allowing the Commission to recover financial damages to compensate the State for the loss of any wildlife. Hunter Education requirements are imposed as a remedial measure to increase knowledge and prevent future violations and not as punishment. The Commission was asked to consider and take action on the license revocations and/or civil assessments for the individuals listed above.

**Motion:** Ammons moved and Zieler seconded THAT THE COMMISSION VOTE TO TAKE JURISDICTION IN THESE CASES.

**Vote:** Unanimous

\* \* \* \* \*

Ramon A. De La Torre Docket # 2016-0021

De La Torre was found guilty by the Pima County Consolidated Justice Court for Count A: Possess/transport unlawfully taken wildlife (mule deer); and Count B: Possess/transport wildlife without tag attached; and sentenced: Fined \$1,406.00; suspend \$706.00 with completion of AGFD Hunter Education class by October 22, 2015.

De La Torre was present and addressed the Commission and apologized for his actions. Initially, he made a mistake and then tried to cover it up by lying to the officers. Mr. De La Torre read his father's testimony to the Commission (on file). The letter stated that some information in the report is not correct. He wears a hearing aid and may not have clearly understood all the questions that were asked. De La Torre stated that he has learned in the Hunter Education course to always know your target.

Commissioner Zieler confirmed with Mr. De La Torre that he had completed the Hunter Education course and taken his field test.

Case Officer Guerena was present and addressed the Commission. He had nothing further to add.

Motion: Ammons moved and Sparks seconded THAT THE LICENSE(S) AND/OR LICENSES PRIVILEGES OF RAMON A. DE LA TORRE TO HUNT, FISH AND TRAP IN THE STATE OF ARIZONA BE REVOKED AND HE BE DENIED ANOTHER FOR A PERIOD OF THREE (3) YEARS; THAT THE CURRENT LICENSE(S) BE SUSPENDED AS OF THE DATE OF THIS HEARING, AND THAT IT/THEY BE REVOKED AS OF THE DATE THE ORDER IN THIS CASE IS SIGNED BY THE DIRECTOR; THAT HE BE REQUIRED TO COMPLETE THE HUNTER EDUCATION COURSE, AND PROVIDE PROOF TO THE DEPARTMENT'S LAW ENFORCEMENT BRANCH, BEFORE APPLYING FOR ANY OTHER LICENSE TO HUNT IN THIS STATE; THAT THE DEPARTMENT BE DIRECTED TO COLLECT CIVIL DAMAGES OR TO BRING CIVIL ACTION AGAINST RAMON A. DE LA TORRE TO COLLECT THE AMOUNT OF \$1,500.00 FOR THE LOSS OF ONE (1) 3X2 MULE DEER BUCK; AND FURTHER MOVE THAT THE DIRECTOR, AS SECRETARY TO THE COMMISSION, BE DIRECTED TO SIGN AND ISSUE A FINDING OF FACT, CONCLUSIONS OF LAW AND AN ORDER IN THIS MATTER PURSUANT TO THIS MOTION.

Commissioner Zieler suggested a friendly amendment to state that Mr. De La Torre need only to show proof of his recently completed Hunter Education Course, and not re-take the course.

Commissioners Ammons and Sparks accepted the amendment.

Amended Motion: Ammons moved and Sparks seconded THAT THE LICENSE(S) AND/OR LICENSES PRIVILEGES OF RAMON A. DE LA TORRE TO HUNT, FISH AND TRAP IN THE STATE OF ARIZONA BE REVOKED AND HE BE DENIED ANOTHER FOR A PERIOD OF THREE (3) YEARS; THAT THE CURRENT LICENSE(S) BE SUSPENDED AS OF THE DATE OF THIS HEARING, AND THAT IT/THEY BE REVOKED AS OF THE DATE THE ORDER IN THIS CASE IS SIGNED BY THE DIRECTOR; THAT HE BE REQUIRED TO PROVIDE PROOF OF COMPLETION OF THE HUNTER EDUCATION COURSE TO THE DEPARTMENT'S LAW ENFORCEMENT BRANCH BEFORE APPLYING FOR ANY OTHER LICENSE TO HUNT IN THIS STATE; THAT THE DEPARTMENT BE DIRECTED TO COLLECT CIVIL DAMAGES OR TO BRING CIVIL ACTION AGAINST RAMON A. DE LA TORRE TO COLLECT THE AMOUNT OF \$1,500.00 FOR THE LOSS OF ONE (1) 3X2 MULE DEER BUCK; AND FURTHER MOVE THAT THE DIRECTOR, AS SECRETARY TO THE COMMISSION, BE DIRECTED TO SIGN AND ISSUE A FINDING OF FACT, CONCLUSIONS OF LAW AND AN ORDER IN THIS MATTER PURSUANT TO THIS MOTION.

**Vote:** Unanimous

\* \* \* \* \*

James E. Duncan Docket # 2016-0029 Duncan was found guilty by the Desert Ridge Justice Court for Citation A06836: Count A: Obtain 2014 Resident elk tag by fraud; and sentenced: Fined \$500.00 and ordered to pay restitution of \$1.325.75.

Case Officer Nemlowill was not present.

Duncan was present and addressed the Commission stating that he owns a home in Prescott. The regulations state that you must be a resident or 6 months. He did not know the definition of a bonafide resident at that time. He had a residence in California at the same time and felt he had dual residence in both states. He had no intention of any fraud.

Commissioner Sparks confirmed with Mr. Duncan that he never filed Arizona income taxes, only California income taxes, that he does not have an Arizona driver's license, and that he pled guilty in court.

Motion: Ammons moved and Zieler seconded THAT THE LICENSE(S) AND/OR LICENSES PRIVILEGES OF <u>JAMES E. DUNCAN</u> TO <u>HUNT, FISH AND TRAP</u> IN THE STATE OF ARIZONA BE REVOKED AND HE BE DENIED ANOTHER FOR A PERIOD OF <u>THREE</u> (3) <u>YEARS</u>; THAT THE CURRENT LICENSE(S) BE SUSPENDED AS OF THE DATE OF THIS HEARING, AND THAT IT/THEY BE REVOKED AS OF THE DATE THE ORDER IN THIS CASE IS SIGNED BY THE DIRECTOR; THAT HE BE REQUIRED TO COMPLETE THE HUNTER EDUCATION COURSE, AND PROVIDE PROOF TO THE DEPARTMENT'S LAW ENFORCEMENT BRANCH, BEFORE APPLYING FOR ANY OTHER LICENSE TO HUNT IN THIS STATE; AND FURTHER MOVE THAT THE DIRECTOR, AS SECRETARY TO THE COMMISSION, BE DIRECTED TO SIGN AND ISSUE A FINDING OF FACT, CONCLUSIONS OF LAW AND AN ORDER IN THIS MATTER PURSUANT TO THIS MOTION.

**Vote:** Unanimous

\* \* \* \* \*

Michael E. Morris
Docket # 2016-0001

Morris was found guilty by the Cochise County Justice Court #1 for Count A: Unlawful take of wildlife (coyote); Count B: Unlawful take of wildlife (bobcat); and Count C: Unlawful possession of wildlife (bobcats); and sentenced: Ordered to pay restitution of \$2,000.00 to the Wildlife Theft Prevention Fund.

Morris was not present.

Case Officer Braun was present.

**Motion:** Sparks moved and Zieler seconded THAT THE LICENSE(S) AND/OR LICENSES PRIVILEGES OF **MICHAEL E. MORRIS** TO **HUNT, FISH AND TRAP** IN THE STATE OF ARIZONA BE REVOKED AND HE BE DENIED ANOTHER FOR A PERIOD OF **FIVE** (5) **YEARS**; THAT THE CURRENT LICENSE(S) BE SUSPENDED AS OF THE DATE OF

THIS HEARING, AND THAT IT/THEY BE REVOKED AS OF THE DATE THE ORDER IN THIS CASE IS SIGNED BY THE DIRECTOR; THAT HE BE REQUIRED TO COMPLETE THE HUNTER EDUCATION COURSE, AND PROVIDE PROOF TO THE DEPARTMENT'S LAW ENFORCEMENT BRANCH, BEFORE APPLYING FOR ANY OTHER LICENSE TO HUNT IN THIS STATE; THAT THE DEPARTMENT BE DIRECTED TO COLLECT CIVIL DAMAGES OR TO BRING CIVIL ACTION AGAINST MICHAEL E. MORRIS TO COLLECT THE AMOUNT OF \$2,000.00 FOR THE LOSS OF ONE (1) COYOTE AND SEVEN (7) BOBCATS; AND FURTHER MOVE THAT THE DIRECTOR, AS SECRETARY TO THE COMMISSION, BE DIRECTED TO SIGN AND ISSUE A FINDING OF FACT, CONCLUSIONS OF LAW AND AN ORDER IN THIS MATTER PURSUANT TO THIS MOTION.

**Vote:** Unanimous

\* \* \* \* \*

The cases of Balma and Charette are related.

Joseph W. Balma Docket # 2016-0019

Balma was found guilty by the Cochise County Justice Court #3 for Count D: Take wildlife during closed season (javelina); and sentenced: Fined \$513.60.

Balma was not present.

Mr. Elms read an email from Mr. Balma to the Commission (on file). The emailed stated that he and Irene Charette would not have pled guilty if they knew they would have to go through another proceeding. He further explained that he was hazing javelina off his property when he got into a situation where he had to defend his dogs. He felt his actions were justified.

Case Officer Guerena answered questions for the Commission stating that Mr. Balma has not had a hunting license and would like to get into hunting. Mr. Balma could have called off his dogs and let the javelina go, but he shot it with his handgun.

Motion: Madden moved and Sparks seconded THAT THE LICENSE(S) AND/OR LICENSES PRIVILEGES OF JOSEPH W. BALMA TO HUNT, FISH AND TRAP IN THE STATE OF ARIZONA BE REVOKED AND HE BE DENIED ANOTHER FOR A PERIOD OF TWO (2) YEARS; THAT THE CURRENT LICENSE(S) BE SUSPENDED AS OF THE DATE OF THIS HEARING, AND THAT IT/THEY BE REVOKED AS OF THE DATE THE ORDER IN THIS CASE IS SIGNED BY THE DIRECTOR; THAT HE BE REQUIRED TO COMPLETE THE HUNTER EDUCATION COURSE, AND PROVIDE PROOF TO THE DEPARTMENT'S LAW ENFORCEMENT BRANCH, BEFORE APPLYING FOR ANY OTHER LICENSE TO HUNT IN THIS STATE; THAT THE DEPARTMENT BE DIRECTED TO COLLECT CIVIL DAMAGES OR TO BRING CIVIL ACTION AGAINST JOSEPH W. BALMA TO COLLECT THE FULL AMOUNT OF \$500.00 FOR THE LOSS OF ONE (1) JAVELINA; AND FURTHER MOVE THAT THE DIRECTOR, AS SECRETARY TO THE COMMISSION, BE DIRECTED TO SIGN AND ISSUE A FINDING OF FACT.

CONCLUSIONS OF LAW AND AN ORDER IN THIS MATTER PURSUANT TO THIS MOTION.

Commission Zieler noted that his motion calls for the full amount to be paid by Joseph Balma and not a shared amount with Irene Charette.

**Vote:** Unanimous

\* \* \* \* \*

<u>Irene M. Charette</u> Docket # 2016-0020

Charette was found guilty by the Cochise County Justice Court #3 for Count A: Possess unlawfully taken wildlife (javelina); and sentenced: Fined \$286.60.

Charette was not present.

Case Officer Guerena was present.

Motion: Sparks moved and Madden seconded THAT THE LICENSE(S) AND/OR LICENSES PRIVILEGES OF IRENE M. CHARETTE TO HUNT, FISH AND TRAP IN THE STATE OF ARIZONA BE REVOKED AND SHE BE DENIED ANOTHER UNTIL SHE COMPLETES THE HUNTER EDUCATION COURSE, AND PROVIDES PROOF TO THE DEPARTMENT'S LAW ENFORCEMENT BRANCH, BEFORE APPLYING FOR ANY OTHER LICENSE TO HUNT IN THIS STATE; AND FURTHER MOVE THAT THE DIRECTOR, AS SECRETARY TO THE COMMISSION, BE DIRECTED TO SIGN AND ISSUE A FINDING OF FACT, CONCLUSIONS OF LAW AND AN ORDER IN THIS MATTER PURSUANT TO THIS MOTION.

**Vote:** Unanimous

\* \* \* \* \*

The cases of Perez and Ball are related.

Christopher M. Perez Docket # 2016-0026

Perez was found guilty by the Tucson Animal Welfare Court #1001 for Citation A01404: Count A: Take wildlife by unlawful method (3x3 trophy white-tailed deer); Citation A01353: Count A: Possession of unlawfully taken wildlife (white-tailed deer buck); Citation A01406: Count A: Take wildlife without a valid license (white-tailed deer doe); Citation A01435: Count A: Take wildlife without a valid license (gambel's quail); Citation A01433: Count A: Take wildlife without a valid license (red-tailed hawk); and sentenced: Fined \$750.00 suspended with completion of all terms of plea agreement, 90 days in jail, 100 hours of community service, 24 months unsupervised probation, and completion of the hunter education and animal treatment offender program.

Perez was not present.

Mr. Elms read a letter to the Commission from Mr. Perez (on file) stating that he was sorry for his transgressions.

Case Officers Guerena and Simmons were present.

Chairman Davis thanked the case officers for their work and persistence in this case. It is the most outrageous series of violations and disregard for wildlife that he has seen in his time on the Commission.

Motion: Zieler moved and Madden seconded THAT THE LICENSE(S) AND/OR LICENSES PRIVILEGES OF CHRISTOPHER M. PEREZ TO HUNT, FISH AND TRAP IN THE STATE OF ARIZONA BE REVOKED AND HE BE DENIED ANOTHER FOR A PERIOD OF FIVE (5) YEARS FOR THE TAKE OF ONE (1) 3X3 TROPHY WHITE-TAILED DEER (CITATION A01404); THAT THE CURRENT LICENSE(S) BE SUSPENDED AS OF THE DATE OF THIS HEARING, AND THAT IT/THEY BE REVOKED AS OF THE DATE THE ORDER IN THIS CASE IS SIGNED BY THE DIRECTOR; THAT HE BE REQUIRED TO COMPLETE THE HUNTER EDUCATION COURSE, AND PROVIDE PROOF TO THE DEPARTMENT'S LAW ENFORCEMENT BRANCH, BEFORE APPLYING FOR ANY OTHER LICENSE TO HUNT IN THIS STATE; THAT THE DEPARTMENT BE DIRECTED TO COLLECT CIVIL DAMAGES OR TO BRING CIVIL ACTION AGAINST CHRISTOPHER M. PEREZ TO COLLECT THE AMOUNT OF \$8,000.00 FOR THE LOSS OF ONE (1) 3X3 TROPHY WHITE-TAILED DEER (CITATION A01404); AND FURTHER MOVE THAT THE DIRECTOR, AS SECRETARY TO THE COMMISSION, BE DIRECTED TO SIGN AND ISSUE A FINDING OF FACT, CONCLUSIONS OF LAW AND AN ORDER IN THIS MATTER PURSUANT TO THIS MOTION.

**Vote:** Unanimous

Motion: Zieler moved and Madden seconded THAT THE LICENSE(S) AND/OR LICENSES PRIVILEGES OF CHRISTOPHER M. PEREZ TO HUNT, FISH AND TRAP IN THE STATE OF ARIZONA BE REVOKED AND HE BE DENIED ANOTHER FOR A PERIOD OF TEN (10) YEARS FOR THE TAKE OF ONE (1) WHITE-TAILED DEER DOE (CITATION A01406);; THAT THE CURRENT LICENSE(S) BE SUSPENDED AS OF THE DATE OF THIS HEARING, AND THAT IT/THEY BE REVOKED AS OF THE DATE THE ORDER IN THIS CASE IS SIGNED BY THE DIRECTOR; THAT HE BE REQUIRED TO COMPLETE THE HUNTER EDUCATION COURSE, AND PROVIDE PROOF TO THE DEPARTMENT'S LAW ENFORCEMENT BRANCH, BEFORE APPLYING FOR ANY OTHER LICENSE TO HUNT IN THIS STATE; THAT THE DEPARTMENT BE DIRECTED TO COLLECT CIVIL DAMAGES OR TO BRING CIVIL ACTION AGAINST CHRISTOPHER M. PEREZ TO COLLECT THE AMOUNT OF \$1,500.00 FOR THE LOSS OF ONE (1) WHITE-TAILED DEER DOE (CITATION A01406); AND FURTHER MOVE THAT THE DIRECTOR, AS SECRETARY TO THE COMMISSION, BE DIRECTED TO SIGN AND ISSUE A FINDING OF FACT, CONCLUSIONS OF LAW AND AN ORDER IN THIS MATTER PURSUANT TO THIS MOTION.

**Vote:** Unanimous

**Motion:** Zieler moved and Madden seconded THAT THE DEPARTMENT BE DIRECTED TO COLLECT CIVIL DAMAGES OR TO BRING CIVIL ACTION AGAINST **CHRISTOPHER M. PEREZ** TO COLLECT THE AMOUNT OF **\$1,800.00** FOR THE LOSS OF:

- ONE (1) WHITE-TAILED BUCK (\$1,500.00) (CITATION A01353)
- ONE (1) GAMBEL'S QUAIL (\$50.00 (CITATION A01435)
- ONE (1) RED-TAILED HAWK (\$250) (CITATION A01433);

AND FURTHER MOVE THAT THE DIRECTOR, AS SECRETARY TO THE COMMISSION, BE DIRECTED TO SIGN AND ISSUE A FINDING OF FACT, CONCLUSIONS OF LAW AND AN ORDER IN THIS MATTER PURSUANT TO THIS MOTION.

**Vote:** Unanimous

\* \* \* \* \*

Christopher M. Perez Docket # 2016-0028

Perez was found guilty by the Tucson Animal Welfare Court #1001 for Citation A01430: Count A: Take wildlife without a valid license (five (5) white-tailed deer); Citation A01428: Count A: Take wildlife without a valid license (2x2 white-tailed deer); Citation A01422: Count A: Take wildlife without a valid license (3x3 trophy white-tailed deer); Citation A01437: Count A: Take wildlife without a valid license (4x4 trophy mule deer); Citation A01426: Count A: Take wildlife without a valid license (3x3 trophy white-tailed deer); Citation A01424: Count A: Take wildlife without a valid license (3x3 trophy white-tailed deer); Citation A01410: Count A: Take wildlife without a valid license (white-tailed deer); Citation A01434: Count A: Take wildlife without a valid license (gray fox); and sentenced: Fined \$750.00 suspended with completion of all terms of plea agreement, 90 days in jail, 100 hours of community service, 24 months unsupervised probation, and completion of the hunter education and animal treatment offender program.

Motion: Zieler moved and Madden seconded THAT THE LICENSE(S) AND/OR LICENSES PRIVILEGES OF <u>CHRISTOPHER M. PEREZ</u> TO <u>HUNT, FISH AND TRAP</u> IN THE STATE OF ARIZONA BE REVOKED AND HE BE DENIED THE PRIVILEGE TO TAKE WILDLIFE <u>PERMANENTLY</u> FOR THE TAKE OF <u>FIVE (5) WHITE-TAILED DEER</u>; THAT THE CURRENT LICENSE(S) BE SUSPENDED AS OF THE DATE OF THIS HEARING, AND THAT IT/THEY BE REVOKED AS OF THE DATE THE ORDER IN THIS CASE IS SIGNED BY THE DIRECTOR; THAT THE DEPARTMENT BE DIRECTED TO COLLECT CIVIL DAMAGES OR TO BRING CIVIL ACTION AGAINST <u>CHRISTOPHER M. PEREZ</u> TO COLLECT THE <u>SHARED</u> AMOUNT OF <u>\$42,750.00</u> FOR THE LOSS OF:

- FIVE (5) WHITE-TAILED DEER (CITATION A01430) (\$7,500.00)
- ONE (1) 2X2 WHITE-TAILED DEER (CITATION A01428) (\$1,500.00)
- ONE (1) 3X3 TROPHY WHITE-TAILED DEER (CITATION A01422) (\$8,000.00)

- ONE (1) 4X4 TROPHY MULE DEER (CITATION A01437) (\$8,000.00)
- ONE (1) 3X3 TROPHY WHITE-TAILED DEER (CITATION A01426) (\$8,000.00)
- ONE (1) 3X3 TROPHY WHITE-TAILED DEER (CITATION A01424) (\$8,000.00)
- ONE (1) WHITE-TAILED DEER (CITATION A01410) (\$1,500.00)
- ONE (1) GRAY FOX (CITATION A01434) (\$250.00);

AND FURTHER MOVE THAT THE DIRECTOR, AS SECRETARY TO THE COMMISSION, BE DIRECTED TO SIGN AND ISSUE A FINDING OF FACT, CONCLUSIONS OF LAW AND AN ORDER IN THIS MATTER PURSUANT TO THIS MOTION.

**Vote:** Unanimous

\* \* \* \*

Christopher J. Ball Docket # 2016-0027

Ball was found guilty by the Tucson Animal Welfare Court #1001 for Citation A07124: Count A: Take wildlife without a valid license (five (5) white-tailed deer); and Count C: Take wildlife by unlawful method; Citation A07122: Count A: Take wildlife without a valid license (2x2 white-tailed deer); Citation A01394: Count A: Take wildlife without a valid license (3x3 trophy white-tailed deer); Citation A01437: Count A: Take wildlife without a valid license (4x4 trophy mule deer); Citation A01400: Count A: Take wildlife without a valid license (3x3 trophy white-tailed deer); Citation A01398: Count A: Take wildlife without a valid license (3x3 trophy white-tailed deer); Citation A01396: Count A: Take wildlife without a valid license (white-tailed deer); Citation A07127: Count A: Take wildlife without a valid license (gray fox); and sentenced: Fined \$750.00 suspended with completion of all terms of plea agreement, 90 days in jail, 100 hours of community service, 24 months unsupervised probation, and completion of the hunter education and animal treatment offender program.

Ball was not present.

Mr. Elms informed the Commission that Mr. Ball's license has been previously revoked for 5 years, so the Department has provided recommendations starting with a 10-year revocation period.

Case Officers Guerena and Simmons were present.

Motion: Madden moved and Ammons seconded THAT THE LICENSE(S) AND/OR LICENSES PRIVILEGES OF <u>CHRISTOPHER J. BALL</u> TO <u>HUNT, FISH AND TRAP</u> IN THE STATE OF ARIZONA BE REVOKED AND HE BE DENIED ANOTHER FOR A PERIOD OF <u>TEN (10) YEARS</u>; FOR THE TAKE OF FIVE (5) WHITE-TAILED DEER (CITATION A07124); THAT THE CURRENT LICENSE(S) BE SUSPENDED AS OF THE DATE OF THIS HEARING, AND THAT IT/THEY BE REVOKED AS OF THE DATE THE ORDER IN THIS CASE IS SIGNED BY THE DIRECTOR; THAT THE DEPARTMENT BE DIRECTED TO COLLECT CIVIL DAMAGES OR TO BRING CIVIL ACTION AGAINST <u>CHRISTOPHER J. BALL</u> TO COLLECT THE <u>SHARED</u> AMOUNT OF <u>\$7,500.00</u> FOR

THE LOSS OF **FIVE (5) WHITE-TAILED DEER (CITATION A07124)**; AND FURTHER MOVE THAT THE DIRECTOR, AS SECRETARY TO THE COMMISSION, BE DIRECTED TO SIGN AND ISSUE A FINDING OF FACT, CONCLUSIONS OF LAW AND AN ORDER IN THIS MATTER PURSUANT TO THIS MOTION.

**Vote:** Unanimous

Motion: Madden moved and Sparks seconded THAT THE LICENSE(S) AND/OR LICENSES PRIVILEGES OF <u>CHRISTOPHER J. BALL</u> TO <u>HUNT, FISH AND TRAP</u> IN THE STATE OF ARIZONA BE REVOKED AND HE BE DENIED THE PRIVILEGE TO TAKE WILDLIFE <u>PERMANENTLY</u> FOR THE TAKE OF <u>ONE (1) 2X2 WHITE-TAILED DEER;</u> THAT THE CURRENT LICENSE(S) BE SUSPENDED AS OF THE DATE OF THIS HEARING, AND THAT IT/THEY BE REVOKED AS OF THE DATE THE ORDER IN THIS CASE IS SIGNED BY THE DIRECTOR; THAT THE DEPARTMENT BE DIRECTED TO COLLECT CIVIL DAMAGES OR TO BRING CIVIL ACTION AGAINST <u>CHRISTOPHER J. BALL</u> TO COLLECT THE <u>SHARED</u> AMOUNT OF <u>\$1,500.00</u> FOR THE LOSS OF <u>ONE (1) 2X2 WHITE-TAILED DEER (CITATION A07122)</u>; AND FURTHER MOVE THAT THE DIRECTOR, AS SECRETARY TO THE COMMISSION, BE DIRECTED TO SIGN AND ISSUE A FINDING OF FACT, CONCLUSIONS OF LAW AND AN ORDER IN THIS MATTER PURSUANT TO THIS MOTION.

**Vote:** Unanimous

**Motion:** Madden moved and Sparks seconded THAT THE DEPARTMENT BE DIRECTED TO COLLECT CIVIL DAMAGES OR TO BRING CIVIL ACTION AGAINST **CHRISTOPHER J. BALL** TO COLLECT THE **SHARED** AMOUNT OF **\$33,750.00** FOR THE LOSS OF:

- ONE (1) 3X3 TROPHY WHITE-TAILED DEER (CITATION A01394) (\$8,000.00)
- ONE (1) 4X4 TROPHY MULE DEER (CITATION A01438) (\$8,000.00)
- ONE (1) 3X3 TROPHY WHITE-TAILED DEER (CITATION A01400) (\$8,000.00)
- ONE (1) 3X3 TROPHY WHITE-TAILED DEER (CITATION A01398) (\$8,000.00)
- ONE (1) WHITE-TAILED DEER (CITATION A01396) (\$1,500.00)
- ONE (1) GRAY FOX (CITATION A07127) (\$250.00);

AND FURTHER MOVE THAT THE DIRECTOR, AS SECRETARY TO THE COMMISSION, BE DIRECTED TO SIGN AND ISSUE A FINDING OF FACT, CONCLUSIONS OF LAW AND AN ORDER IN THIS MATTER PURSUANT TO THIS MOTION.

**Vote:** Unanimous

\* \* \* \* \*

These hearings concluded at 3:02 p.m.

\* \* \* \* \*